CARTER **NEWELL**

First Party Insurance in Australia: Legal Essays





Carter Newell Lawyers is an award winning Australian law firm providing specialist legal advice to national and international corporate clients.

Law Specialists in:

- Insurance
- Construction, Projects & Infrastructure
- Aviation & Transport
- Workplace Advisory
- Litigation & Dispute Resolution
- Commercial Property
- Planning & Environment
- Corporate & Commercial
- Energy & Resources

Carter Newell Lawyers has built one of the laruest specialist insurance practices in Australia. Our services are exclusively tailored for major insurance companies, Lloyd's syndicates, underwriting agencies, captive insurers, affinity groups, self-insureds, and insurance brokers.

With a track record of award-winning excellence, our insurance team stands out for its exceptional quality. in-depth knowledge, and innovative claims management approach. These key attributes have positioned it as a leader in the insurance sector in Australia.

World Partnerships

Carter Newell Lawyers is a member of Insurance Law Global (ILG) and TAGLaw which provides world leading collaboration for the benefit of clients.





Insurance Law Global (ILG) is a multi-jurisdictional network or best-in-class law firms dedicated to serving the insurance industry. ILG members are committed to nelping clients respond to the cna lenges and opportunities presented by globalisation and the increasingly diverse needs of the nsurance industry.

TAGLaw (a division of TAGAII ances) is an international ailiance of independent law firms providing a full range of legal services to clients all over the world. With more than 160 firms n over 90 countries. TAGLaw ranks among the five argest egal alliances globally and has been consistently recognised as 'Elite' by Chambers and Partners.

This Guide was prepared by reference to current case, aw and egisiation in force as at November 2023, but does not purport to be an exhaustive statement of all applicable case, aw and egisiation.

Due to the extensive nature of this Guide, there may be some references to case aw and egislation that are no onger current. This Guide attempts to draw out the most significant points in the relevant case aw and egislation. Whilst all care has been taken to ensure that the most up to date information has been included, not all aspects of the base law and egislation have been covered. The material contained in this Guide s in the nature of general comment only, and neither purports nor is intended to be advice on any particular matter. No reader should act on the basis of any matter contained in this publication without considering, and if necessary, taking appropriate professional advice upon his or her own particular

© Carter Newell Lawyers 2023





First Party Insurance in Australia: Legal Essays

Patrick Mead



Carter Newell Publications
Sydney • Melbourne • Brisbane

PREFACE

In Farriss v Axford (No 2)¹ Cavanagh J discussed the distinction between a liability policy, in which the indemnity sought would be in respect of a liability to pay damages to a third party, and a first party insurance policy under which an insured person makes a claim in respect of damage to their goods.

In *Hronopoulos v Building Appeals Board*² Mukhtar AsJ adopted the explanation contained in *Sutton on Insurance Law* (Lawbook, 4th ed. 2015), that the peril in first party insurance destroys or diminishes the insureds' person, property or interest or deprives the insured of it's use.

These essays in relation to first party insurance have been compiled for the assistance of insurers and their advisors, brokers, loss adjustors, third party administrators and other insurance industry professionals.

It is hoped that the topics covered will afford the reader a greater understanding of the process of, and approach to, first party policy wordings by the courts, through the detailed analysis contained herein.

Patrick Mead Partner Carter Newell Lawyers

LLB (Hons); LLM: FRI
Registered Adjudicator (BIF Act),
Graded Arbitrator (empanelled AIAC),

Accredited Mediator (RI)

Direct Line: +61 7 3000 8353

Mobile: +61 (0) 414 267 305

Email: pmead@carternewell.com

¹ [2021] NSWSC 1055, [21].

² [2022] VSC 376, [52].

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDUCTIBLES, AGGREGATION AND LIMITS OF LIABILITY 1
INSURANCE POLICY EXCLUSIONS FOR 'FLOOD'
SCRATCHED GLASS CLAIMS
JUDICIAL CONSIDERATION OF LEG 2/96 AND LEG 3/0693
LIMITATION PERIODS: WHEN DOES THE CAUSE OF ACTION ARISE UNDER A POLICY OF INDEMNITY INSURANCE?
SUB-LIMITS UNDER AN ISR POLICY: CAN THEY BE STACKED? 131
BASIS OF SETTLEMENT IN ISR POLICIES: OBLIGATION ON INSURER TO PAY INDEMNITY VALUE OR REINSTATEMENT VALUE?
ISR POLICIES: ECOR, 'ALTERATIONS' AND THE >50% TEST 155
PROGRESSIVE PHYSICAL DAMAGE AND PERILS EXCLUSIONS CL4 IN ISR MARK IV
THE IMPACT OF WAIVER OF SUBROGATION CLAUSES ON INSURERS' RIGHTS OF RECOVERY
INSURANCE IMPLICATIONS OF TRANSFER OF RISK FROM CONSTRUCTION TO THE OPERATIONAL PHASE OF MAJOR PROJECTS
FIRST PARTY INSURANCE: CONTRACTING INSURED OR THIRD PARTY BENEFICIARY (AND WHAT OF 'NOTING INTERESTS'?)

Aboriginal Legal Service of WA v Lawrence (No 2) (2008) 37 WAR 450; [2008] WASCA 254
AB WDev, LLC v Cont'l Cas Co, 203 NE3d 922, 928 (III 2022) 109
Acciona Infrastructure Canada Inc v Allianz Global Risks US Insurance Co 2015 BCCA 34775, 94, 101, 103, 104, 114, 119
Admiral International Pty Ltd v Insurance Australia Ltd [2022] NSWCA 277 128
AIG Europe Ltd v OC320301 LLP [2016] All ER (D) 121 (Apr); [2016] EWCA Civ 367
AIG Europe Ltd v OC320301 LLP [2015] EWHC 2398 (Comm)
Ali v Insurance Australia Limited [2022] NSWCA 174
Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd v Rawson Homes Pty Ltd [2021] NSWCA 224
All Covers & Accessories Pty Ltd v Sidawi (2012) 36 VR 113; [2012] VSC 48104
Allstate Exploration NL v QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd [2008] VSCA 148 117
Altru Health System v American Protection Insurance Co 238 F3d 961 (8th Cir 2001); No 00-1209
Am States Ins Co v Koloms, 687 NE2d 72 (III 1997))
Aspioti v Leigh [2003] NSWSC 1224
Australian Rail Track Corporation Ltd v QBE Insurance (Europe) Ltd & Ors [2013] NSWCA 17522, 40
Axa Global Risks (UK) Ltd v Haskins Contractors Pty Ltd (2004) 13 ANZ Ins Cas 61-611; [2004] NSWCA 138
AXA Reinsurance (UK) PLC v Field [1996] 3 All ER 517; [1996] 1 WLR 10269
Bacardi v Thomas Hardy Packaging [2002] 2 Lloyd's Rep 379
Bigby v Kondra & Anor [2017] QSC 371
Brescia Furniture Pty Ltd v QBE Insurance (Australia) Limited (2007) 14 ANZ Ins Cas 61-740; [2007] NSWSC 598144, 146
CA Blackwell (Contractors) Ltd v Gerling Allegemeine Verischerungs AG [2007] EWCA Civ 145088, 115
Caine v Lumley General Insurance Limited (2008) 15 ANZ Ins Cas 61-756; [2008] NSWCA 4
Callaghan v Dominion Insurance Co Ltd [1997] 2 Lloyd's Re 541 20
Canty v PaperlinX Australia Pty Ltd [2014] NSWCA 309
Carillion Construction Ltd v AIG Australia Ltd [2016] NSWSC 495 123 126

Caudle v Sharp [1995] LRLR 433; [1995] CLC 642
CE Health Casualty & General Insurance Ltd v Grey (1993) 32 NSWLR 25, 45-6; [1993] NSWCA 52
CGU Insurance v Watson [2007] NSWCA 301 124, 126
CIC Insurance Ltd v Bankstown Football Club Ltd [1994] NSWCA 359144, 147
CIMIC Group Limited v AIG Group Limited [2022] NSWSC 999
City of Kwinana v Lamont (2014) 201 LGERA 334; [2014] WASCA 112 156
Commonwealth Bank of Australia v Baltica General Insurance Co Ltd (1992) 28 NSWLR 579
Contractors Pty Ltd v Norcon Pty Ltd (2001) 11 ANZ Ins Cas 61-509; [2001] WASCA 364
Cook v Cook (1986) 68 ALR 353; [1986] HCA 73
Co-Operative Bulk Handling Ltd v Jennings Industries Ltd (1996) 17 WAR 257
Corbett v Vero Insurance New Zealand Limited [2019] NZHC 182382, 85, 118
Countrywide Assured Group PLC v Marshall [2002] All ER (D) 203 (Oct); [2002] EWHC 2082 (Comm)
Cultural Foundation (t/a American School of Dubai) v Beazley Furlonge Ltd [2018] EWHC 1083 (Comm)
Dalby Bio-Refinery Ltd v Allianz Australia Insurance Limited [2019] FCAFC30
Dellavedova v HIH Casualty & General Insurance Ltd (1997) 9 ANZ Ins Cases 61-383; [1999] FCA 456
Delta Pty Ltd v Mechanical & Construction Insurance Pty Ltd [2019] 3 Qd R 438
Distillers Co Bio-Chemicals (Aust) Pty Ltd v Ajax Insurance Co Ltd (1974) 130 CLR 1; [1974] HCA 3
Eastern Suburbs Leagues Club Ltd v Royal & Sun Alliance Insurance Australia Ltd (2004) 13 ANZ Ins Cas 61-599; [2003] QSC 413
Elilade Pty Ltd v Nonpareil Pty Ltd (2002) 124 FCR 1; [2002] FCA 90944, 49, 57
Endurance Corporate Capital Ltd v Sartex Quilts & Textiles Ltd [2020] EWCA Civ 308
Farriss v Axford (No 2) [2021] NSWSC 1055iii
Foster v QBE European Underwriting Services (Australia) Pty Limited as managing agent for Lloyd's Syndicate 386 [2018] NSWSC 440221

GIO Insurance Ltd v Leighton Contractors Pty Ltd (1995) 9 ANZ Ins Cas 61-293232
Globe Church Incorporated v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd & Anor (2019) 99 NSWLR 470; [2019] NSWCA 27
Gorczynski v W & FT Osmo Pty Ltd (2010) 77 NSWLR 62; [2010] NSWCA 163222, 230
Government Insurance Office (NSW) v Atkinson-Leighton Joint Venture (1981) 146 CLR 206; [1981] HCA 9
G & P Procleaners & General Contractors Inc v Gore Mutual Insurance Co 2017 ONCA 29891
GPS Power Pty Ltd v Gardiner Willis & Associates Pty Ltd [2000] QSC 75 161
GPS Power Pty Ltd v Gardiner Willis & Associates Pty Ltd [2001] 2 Qd R 586; [2000] QCA 495
Graeme John Moore v IAG New Zealand Limited [2020] NZCA 319
Great Lakes Reinsurance (UK) SE v Western Trading Ltd [2016] EWCA Civ 1003
Hams v CGU Insurance Ltd (2002) 12 ANZ Ins Cas 61-525; [2002] NSWSC 27344, 45, 49, 57
Harrison & Anor v Hancock & Ors [2019] SADC 163214
Holmes Construction Wellington Ltd v Vero Insurance New Zealand Ltd Unreported, New Zealand District Court, Harrop J, 4 December 2007 73, 85, 89
Hope v Bathurst City Council (1980) 144 CLR 1; [1980] HCA 16216
Hronopoulos v Building Appeals Board [2022] VSC 376iii
Huon Valley Council v Swiss Re International SE [2022] FCA 611 130
Insurance Australia Ltd t/as CGU Insurance v MOS Beverages Pty Ltd (2021) 286 FCR 1, 11; [2021] FCAFC 165; [2021] FCAFC 192220
Insurance Australia Limited v Hortomaris [2021] VCC 954 130
James McHugh Construction Company v Travelers Property Casualty Company of America, 223 F Supp 3d 462 (D Md 2016)91
Johnson Press of Am, Inc v N Ins Co of New York, 791 NE2d 1291, 1298 (2003)
Kennecott Utah Copper Corp v Minet Ltd [2003] All ER (D) 41 (Jul); [2004] 1 All ER (Comm) 60; [2003] EWCA Civ 905
Kennecott Utah Copper Corp v Cornhill Insurance Pty & Ors [1999] 2 All ER (Comm) 801; [2000] Lloyd's Rep IR 179; [1999] EWHC 288 (Comm)203, 208

K Sika Plastics Ltd v Cornhill Insurance Co Ltd [1982] 2 NZLR 50 45, 49, 157
Kuwait Airways Corporation & Anor v Kuwait Insurance Company SAK & Ors [1999] EWHC 281 (Comm)
Kuwait Airways Corporation v Kuwait Insurance Co SAK [1996] 1 Lloyd's Rep 6649
Lake v Simmons [1927] AC 487
Lambert Leasing Inc v QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd (2016) 93 NSWLR 166; [2016] NSWCA 254221, 227
Landel Pty Ltd & Anor v Insurance Australia Ltd [2021] QSC 24741
Larson-Juhl Australia LLC v Jaywest International Pty Ltd (2001) 11 ANZ Ins Cas 61-499; [2001] NSWCA 260
Larson-Juhl Australia LLC v Jaywest International Pty Ltd (2000) 11 ANZ Ins Cas 61-472; [2000] NSWSC 524
Lasermax Engineering Pty Ltd v QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd (2005) 13 ANZ Ins Cas 61-643; [2005] NSWCA 66
LCA Marrickville Pty Limited v Swiss Re International SE (2022) 290 FCR 435; [2022] FCAFC 17
Ledcor Construction Ltd v Northbridge Indemnity Insurance Co [2016] 2 SCR 23
Ledcor Construction Ltd v Northbridge Indemnity Insurance Co 2015 ABCA 12176, 77
Leeds Beckett University v Travelers Insurance Co Ltd [2017] EWHC 558
Limit (No3) Limited v ACE Insurance Limited [2009] NSWSC 1061 21, 24
LMT Surgical Pty Ltd v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd [2014] 2 Qd R 118
L'Union Des Assurances de Paris lard v Sun Alliance Insurance Ltd (1995) 8 ANZ Ins Cas 61-240; [1995] NSWCA 539
Malamit Pty Ltd v WFI Insurance Ltd [2017] NSWCA 162 16
McCann v Switzerland Insurance Australia Ltd (2000) 203 CLR 579; [2000] HCA 65
McMurray v AlG Insurance Australia Ltd [No 5] [2021] WASC 300 193
Mercantile Mutual Insurance (Aust) Ltd v Rowprint Services (Victoria) Pty Ltd [1998] VSCA 147

Mie Force Pty Ltd v Allianz Australia Insurance Limited [2022] NSWSC 1606219, 228
Mitsubishi Electric UK Ltd v Royal London Insurance Ltd & Others (UK) [1994] 2 Lloyd's Rep 249
Mobis Parts Australia Pty Ltd v XL Insurance Co SE (No 7) [2017] NSWSC 1321165, 174
Molyneux Holdings Ltd v IAG New Zealand Ltd [2007] NZCA 254 90
Moore v IAG New Zealand Ltd [2020] Lloyds' Rep IR 167; [2019] NZHC 154926, 34, 40
Mopani Copper Mines PLC v Millennium Underwriting Ltd [2008] All ER (D) 192 (Jun); [2008] 2 All ER (Comm) 976; [2008] EWHC 1331 (Comm) [12]
Morris v Betcke (2005) 13 ANZ Ins Cas 61-665 [58]; [2005] NSWCA 308 220
Murphy Corp Ltd v Acumen Design & Development (Queensland) Pty Ltd (1995) 11 BCL 274; [1991] QSC 368
National Oilwell (UK) Ltd v Davy Offshore Ltd [1993] 2 Lloyd's Rep 582 181
Nicholas v Wesfarmers Curragh Pty Ltd [2010] QSC 447227, 229
Oakleaf v Home Insurance Ltd 1958 CanLII 136 (ON CA)
Orient Overseas Associates v XL Insurance America Inc & Ors 2016 NY Slip Op 31009 (NY Sup Ct 2016)
Oxford Realty Group Cedar v Travelers Excess & Surplus Lines Company (A-85-15) (077617)
Pacific Dunlop Ltd v Maxitherm Boilers Pty Ltd [1998] 4 VR 559; (1996) 9 ANZ Insurance Cases 61-357
Pacific Dunlop Ltd v Swinbank (2001) ANZ Ins Cas 61-496; [2001] VSCA 749
Pacific Dunlop Ltd v Swinbank (1999) 10 ANZ Ins Cas 61-439; [1998] VSC 1549
Palmer v Allianz Australia Workers Compensation (NSW) Limited [2019] NSWDC 107
Pekin Ins Co v Richard Marker Assocs, Inc., 682 NE2d 362, 365 (III App Ct 1997))
Penrith City Council v Government Insurance Office of New South Wales (1991) 24 NSWLR 564
Pentagon Construction (1969) Co Ltd v United States Fidelity & Guaranty Co 77 DLR (3d) 18974

Perkins v Commonwealth Bank of Australia Ltd [2003] NSWSC 346 [294] 23	4
Petersen & Shadomill Pty Ltd v Union des Assurances de Paris IARD	_
(1997) 9 ANZ Ins Cas 61-3664	
Pilkington v CGU Insurance [2004] BLR 9711	8
Placer (PNG) Pty Ltd v Dyno Nobel Asia Pacific Ltd [1999] NSWSC 1292196, 19	7
Ploutos Enterprises Ltd v Stuart Olson Constructors Inc 2008 BCSC 271 7	7
Provincial Insurance Aust Pty Ltd v Consolidated Wood Products (1991) 25 NSWLR 541	5
Prime Infrastructure (DBCT) Management Pty Ltd v Vero Insurance Ltd (2005) 12 ANZ Ins Cas 61-661; [2005] QCA 369	3
Public Transport Ticketing Corp v Integrated Transit Solutions Ltd [2009] NSWSC 54N//	Α
QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd v Lumley General Insurance Ltd (2009) 24 VR 326, 343; [2009] VSCA 12422	0
<i>QBE Insurance Ltd v MGM Plumbing Pty Ltd</i> (2003) 12 ANZ Ins Cas 61-555; [2003] QSC 027	8
Rawson Homes Pty Ltd v Allianz Australia Insurance Ltd [2020] NSWSC 1654	9
Ranicar v Frigmobile [1983] TAS R 11311	8
Recreational Services Ltd v QBE Insurance (International) Ltd (2006) 14 ANZ Ins Cas 61-676; [2006] NZCA 5	0
Re Hest Australia Ltd (2021) 66 VR 338; [2021] VSC 809	0
Revill v John Holland Group Pty Ltd (2022) 295 FCR 269; [2022] FCAFC 17813	
Rickard Constructions Pty Ltd v Rickard Hails Moretti Pty Ltd [2006] NSWCA 356103	3
Rickard Constructions Pty Ltd v Rickard Hails Moretti Pty Ltd [2004] 220 ALR 267; [2004] NSWSC 1041103	3
Ripper v Gattenby (2002) 10 Tas R 435, 442 [22]; [2002] TASSC 45	0
Sayers & Associates Ltd v Insurance Corp of Ireland Ltd (1981) 126 DLR (3d) 681; [1981] ILR 1–143670	4
Scott v Copenhagen Reinsurance Co (UK) Ltd [2003] All ER (D) 218 (May) [2003] EWCA Civ 6882	4

Seele Austria GmbH & Co KG v Tokio Marine Europe Insurance Ltd [2008] All ER (D) 68 (May); [2008] EWCA CiV441
Sheehan v Lloyds Names Munich Re Syndicate Ltd [2017] FCA 1340 70
Skanska Construction UK Ltd v Egger (Barony) Ltd [2002] EWCA Civ 310 115
Solarus Projects Pty Ltd (recs & mgrs apptd) (in liq) v AAI Ltd t/as Vero Insurance (No 8) [2015] NSWSC 412
South Capitol Bridgebuilders v Lexington Insurance Company [Case No 21-cv-1436 (RCL)]
Speno Rail Maintenance Australia Pty Ltd v Hamersley Iron Pty Ltd (2000) 23 WAR 291; [2000] WASCA 408
Spire Healthcare Limited V Royal & Sun Alliance Insurance PLC [2022] EWCA CIV 17
Standard Life Assurance Ltd v Ace European Group [2012] EWHC 104 35
Standard Publishing House (Aust) Pty Ltd v Chen [2012] NSWSC 1544
Strategic Property Holdings No 3 Pty Ltd v Austbrokers RWA Pty Ltd [2012] NSWSC 1570
Strategic Property Holdings No 3 Pty Ltd v Suncorp Metway Insurance Ltd [2009] ACTSC 8
Technology Holdings Ltd v IAG NZ Ltd & Anor [2008] NZHC 1228; Zealand (HC Auckland, Civ-2005-404-3450)117, 118
Ted Corporation Holdings Ltd v QBE Insurance (International) Ltd (HC, Dunedin, CP3/00, 8 September 2000, William Young Jay)
The Owners – Strata Plan No 55682 v WR Berkley Insurance (Europe), PLC (No 3) [2021] NSWDC 15
Thiess Pty Ltd v Parsons Brinckerhoff Australia Pty Ltd [2016] NSWSC 173 189
TJK (NZ) Limited v Mitsui Sumitomo Insurance Company Limited [2013] NZHC 298
Transfield Constructions Pty Ltd v GIO Australia Holdings Pty Ltd [1997] 9 ANZ Ins CAS 61-336
Traveler's Insurance Company v Eljier Manufacturing, Inc, 757 NE2d 481, 491 (III 2001)
<i>Trident General Insurance Co Ltd v McNiece Bros Pty Ltd</i> [1988] HCA 44; (1988) 165 CLR 107
Trustees Executors Ltd v QBE Insurance (International) Ltd [2010] NZCA 60887

FIRST PARTY INSURANCE IN AUSTRALIA: LEGAL ESSAYS

Turner v Morlend Finance Corp (Vic) Pty Ltd [1990] ASC 56-006; [1990] NSWCA 200	216
Vero Insurance Ltd v Australian Prestressing Services Pty Ltd [2013] NSWCA 181	117
Vero Insurance Ltd v Prime Infrastructure (DBCT) Management Pty Ltd [2006] HCATrans 142	
Viking Const Mgmt, Inc v Liberty Mut Ins Co, 831 NE2d 1, 13 (III App Ct 2005)	112
Vivekananda v Insurance Australia Ltd (2014) 225 FCR 1; [2014] FCAFC 116	158
Weir Services Australia Pty Ltd v AXA Corporate Solutions Assurance (2018) 359 ALR 314; [2018] NSWCA 100	. 3, 20, 27
Wiesac Pty Ltd v Insurance Australia Ltd [2019] 1 Qd R 19841, 43, 45, 46, 50, 52, 53, 57,	58, 69, 71
Woodside Petroleum Development Pty Ltd v H & R - E & W Pty Ltd (1999) 20 WAR 380; (1999) 10ANZ Ins Cas 61-430; [1999] WASCA 1024	. 181, 196
<i>Worth v HDI Global Specialty SE</i> (2021) 393 ALR 93; [2021] NSWCA 185128	
Zurich Australian Insurance Ltd v Metals & Minerals Insurance Pte Ltd (2009) 240 CLR 391; [2009] HCA 50226	, 228, 229

TABLE OF LEGISLATION

Building Act 1975 (Qld)	155
s 5	156
s 21	155, 161
s 61	155, 156, 162, 163
s 68	160
s 81	155, 156, 160, 161, 162
Building Act 2004 (ACT)	158
s 23	162
Insurance Contracts Act 1984 (Cth)	149, 220, 221, 222, 235
s 11	223, 226
s 13	149, 223, 232
s 45	223, 227, 228, 229
s 48222, 224, 226,228, 229	, 230, 231, 233, 234, 235,
s 51	220
s 54	221, 222, 225, 230, 231
s 74	222, 225, 232
s 76	225, 229
Insurance Contracts Regulations 1985 (Cth)	42
reg 29C	42
Limitation Act 1969 (NSW)	125
s 14	125
Property Law Act 1974 (Qld)	220, 226
	000 000